



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.



GAVIN NEWSOM
Mayor

JARED BLUMENFELD
Director

Annual Report
Implementation of San Francisco's
Precautionary Purchasing Ordinance - 2008
May 26, 2009

San Francisco Department of the Environment
Presented to the Commission on the Environment, City & County of San Francisco
Prepared by Chris Geiger, Ph.D., Toxics Reduction Program

I. Introduction

A. Executive Summary

The San Francisco Department of the Environment (SFE) and the Office of Contract Administration (OCA) have taken lead roles in implementing the City's Precautionary Purchasing Ordinance. Since the ordinance was passed in 2005, SFE has instituted environmentally preferable specifications for 27 product subcategories in 10 citywide commodities contracts. In terms of dollars spent, overall purchases of SF Approved Green Products increased by 54% in 2008 when compared with 2007. Specifically, purchases of green cleaning products increased by 556%; purchases of janitorial papers increased by 39%, purchases of recyclable/compostable foodware increased by 23%, and purchases of rechargeable batteries increased by 17%. Major accomplishments for 2008 include: The publication of the nation's first listing of low-mercury, long-life, energy-efficient lamps covering all major manufacturers; completion of the first SF Approved Green Products catalog, inclusion of environmental requirements in the citywide information technology (IT) store contract, the completion of two new SF Approved Product lists, a new contract award for energy-efficient electrical fixtures, active participation in national standards development for janitorial cleaning products, implementation of email marketing and survey software, and an experimental web site that serves as a clearing house of City staff reviews of green product effectiveness. Future activities include work on at least three new contract areas—carpets, paint, and compostable trash can liners—plus continued work on improving existing specifications and user buy-in.

B. Mandate

The Precautionary Purchasing Ordinance (SF Environment Code Chapter 2) establishes goals and procedures for environmentally preferable purchasing (green purchasing) by City departments. This ordinance was groundbreaking in its application of the Precautionary Principle (Environment Code, Chapter 1), and in its mandate that purchasers for the city may *only* buy commodities from "approved alternative product lists" for certain products.

The City & County of San Francisco did not begin its green purchasing efforts with the 2005 Ordinance. The Department of the Environment has been informally inserting environmental specifications into citywide term contracts for over ten years, especially related to recycled content of products. The 2005 Ordinance succeeded the Environmentally Preferable Purchasing Ordinance (passed in 1999), which established an ambitious, three-year pilot program in the City. The pilot program researched chemical products purchased by the City, prioritized the products based on potential environmental or health risks and sales volume, identified alternative products, and field tested the alternative products with City staff. It concluded that environmentally preferable products were available for 13 of the 14 product types identified, that 83% of preferable products tested met the majority of City staff performance requirements, and that a citywide green purchasing program was feasible.

The 2005 Ordinance mandates an annual review and report on its implementation not later than 24 months after the effective date of the ordinance (July 17, 2005), with annual reports thereafter in February. This report is submitted in fulfillment of that requirement.

Specifically, Section 203(g) requires:

- (i) an evaluation of the progress in meeting the goals in Section 201;
- (ii) the status and effectiveness of current efforts by City departments to implement this Chapter and additional specific actions, including legislation, needed to effectively implement this Chapter;
- (iii) a summary of the annual reports submitted by City departments pursuant to section 205(b) and a list of waivers granted by the Purchaser during the previous period organized by department.
- (iv) an update on the extent and efficacy of training programs for users and purchasers of Targeted Products;
- (v) a workplan for the next reporting period with specific goals, actions and timelines necessary to implement this Chapter; and
- (vi) The annual report required by this section shall include a recommendation by the Director, after consultation with City Departments and the public, on how to expand this Chapter to City contractors.

C. Report Scope

In its description of program activities, this report covers the calendar year 2008. Previous reports can be found on the SF Environment website: www.sfenvironment.org/sfapproved.

II. Activities and Accomplishments, 2008

SF Approved Products Lists and SF Approved Green Products Catalog: In 2008, the Green Purchasing Program altered its strategy regarding “approved alternative product lists,” also known as the SF Approved Green Products lists. The program identified a strong need for information on appropriate environmental specifications for certain common products – some of which already have acceptable third-party ecolabels/certifications available. For example, there are Green Seal and Ecologo certifications available for outdoor paints and hard floor care products. Because the resources required to screen third-party ecolabels/certifications are minimal, the program instituted

the “SF Suggested” category of products/criteria, in addition to the “SF Approved” products which are mandatory for City departments. SF Suggested products meet SFE environmental and health standards, but have not necessarily met the City’s requirements of effectiveness or affordability. The use of SF Suggested products is not mandatory, but city staff are encouraged to give SFE feedback on product performance. The draft version of the first-ever “[SF Approved Green Products Catalog](#)” was completed at the end of 2008, available at www.sfenvironment.org/sfapproved

The Green Purchasing Program now covers 27 product subcategories in 10 Citywide contracts. Out of the ten “[targeted product categories](#)” identified in 2006, SFE has developed specifications, SF Approved product lists, or SF Suggested listings for nine. The only category yet to be addressed is “grounds maintenance consumables,” such as asphalt or playground surfaces. See *Table 1 for a summary*.

Four SFE Toxics Reduction and Zero Waste Program staff currently work on green purchasing-related activities on a regular basis. SFE staff from other programs are also consulted from time to time. The total SFE time commitment to green purchasing activities currently totals to approximately 2.5 staff positions, including the new green purchasing position at the Office of Contract Administration (OCA), which began duties at the end of 2008. For most of the calendar year 2008, the total staff positions allocated amounts to approximately 1.5 positions.

Increases in SF Approved Product sales: Total purchases of SF Approved Green Products increased by 54% over 2007 levels. See *Table 2 for details*.

Contract award for energy efficient lamp fixtures (part of the electrical materials contract). This is a new contract and specification with extensive implications for long-term energy savings. SFE worked in collaboration with SF PUC and OCA to develop the specifications.

Completion of specifications for new lamps and ballasts contract. SFE worked closely with SF PUC and OCA to update its specifications for lamps and lamp ballasts. The new specifications feature more stringent caps on mercury content and minimums for lamp life and energy efficiency. The request for bids had not yet been advertised as of this writing.

Computer/Information Technology (IT) Contract Development: In 2007 and 2008, SFE staff presented at multiple meetings of the Committee on Information Technology (COIT) and developed language for green IT purchasing, which was eventually adopted as citywide policy by COIT in January, 2008. In April, 2008, Mayor Gavin Newsom issued executive directive #08-01 requiring that all City desktop, laptop, and monitor purchases comply with the EPEAT-Silver level product declaration (EPEAT, or the “Electronic Product Environmental Assessment Tool,” is a system of electronic product registration and spot auditing for environmental attributes, based on the IEEE 1680 standards). EPEAT-Silver was thus added to the SF Approved lists in April, 2008. SFE staff included criteria for product takeback, packaging takeback, and green purchasing outreach in the citywide IT Store request for proposals (RFP), and assisted in bid evaluation. The citywide IT Store contract was awarded at the end of 2008. Because of the rapid expansion of the EPEAT program, SFE continued work with OCA and the Dept. of Technology to further update the City’s criteria, and to add criteria for non-blade type computer servers. COIT adopted these criteria on early 2009, making San Francisco the first City in the nation to require EPEAT-Gold, and also the first City in the nation to adopt Climate Savers Computing Initiative requirements for its servers.

Janitorial Products Trainings: Trainings of custodial staff are necessary not only to get the word out about the City's new products, but also to teach custodial staff what to expect from the new products, which sometimes require a modification of their practices. The trainings also emphasized methods for reducing the use of the more hazardous cleaning chemicals, for example, by refraining from using disinfectants as general purpose cleaners, or by using microfiber mops. Training programs on green cleaning products were begun in the Fall of 2007, with 11 trainings covering 262 City personnel in three major departments during calendar year 2007. In 2008, an addition 55 custodial staff were trained (many more have been trained in the early months of 2009). The loss of the chief trainer in the technical services contract delayed 2008 training efforts considerably.

Green Products Pilot Testing: "Approved" status products are generally are not added without positive data/reports on product performance. Because product performance has regularly been rated as the most important factor in purchasing decisions, the Green Purchasing Program began developing a web-based clearinghouse on green product performance. The web tool is intended primarily for City staff as an information sharing mechanism, and also serves as a repository of comments received during end-user group meetings. [A pilot version of the tool](#) was posted in late 2008; negotiations are underway with the (national) Responsible Purchasing Network to upgrade this into a searchable, password protected tool.

Custodial staff at City Hall and at San Francisco Unified School District have been particularly active in testing new products. Because of the high volume of use, disinfectants and hard floor care products are the highest priority product areas for pilot testing at this time. SFE has contributed consultant time and expertise to a collaborative project with the San Francisco Asthma Task Force at SF Unified School District. As part of this effort, consultants screened specific cleaning products proposed for use by SFUSD and assisted in a pilot project to test safer hard floor care systems and disinfectants.

Reporting of Product Sales: The purchasing system (ADPICS) currently used by the City is poorly adapted for tracking purchases of specific products or categories of products. However, requiring annual purchase reports from each City department would require an enormous amount of City staff time and was considered infeasible. In 2007, SFE staff determined that the most promising approach for tracking green product sales is through the use of vendor sales reports, which cover multiple departments' purchases. Strict contract language requiring detailed quarterly sales reports was therefore included with several of the newer contracts. SFE created computerized data reporting templates to make the reporting more efficient.

However, the collection of vendor sales data for the 2007 annual report also required extensive amounts of SFE staff time. For the 2008 data, an alternative approach was attempted: The new OCA green purchaser was charged with following up with vendors on sales reports, and SFE staff compiled the data. This approach is intended to make the best use of OCA's authority on contracting matters. The results were still inconsistent, however, with some key vendors not submitting any data at all. OCA is exploring ways to penalize these vendors in the future and/or reward vendors who satisfy the reporting requirements.

National Standards Development: San Francisco staff completed its participation in the development of the revised Green Seal GS-37 standard for institutional cleaning products in 2008. In addition, SFE contributes materials on an ongoing basis to the Responsible Purchasing Network

(RPN), a nonprofit organization dedicated to leveraging green purchasing resources (www.responsiblepurchasing.org). SFE is a founding member and steering committee member of the RPN.

Integration with Green Building Activities: In late 2008, the Green Purchasing Program began working with the SFE Green Building Program, Bureau of Building Repair and Dept. of Real Estate to assist in the green building certification process for the City property at 1 South Van Ness Ave. The City aims to obtain certification for the property under the LEED for Existing Buildings – Operations & Maintenance standard (LEED-EBOM). SFE intends to create materials, including janitorial services contract language, green cleaning policies and procedures, and integrated pest management procedures, that can serve as templates for other LEED-EBOM certifications.

Table 1. Summary of products currently addressed by the San Francisco Green Purchasing Program

Category	Sub-Category	Approved* (City Depts. are required to buy this product)	Suggested* (City Depts. are encouraged but not required to try this product)	Citywide Term Contract
Automotive Vehicles	Alternative Fuel Vehicles	Approved		On contract
Batteries: Household Type	Rechargeable	Approved		On contract
Copiers, Printers, Faxes, Scanners	Multi Function Devices (MFDs)	Approved		On contract
**Computer Equipment	Desktops, Laptops, Monitors	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Aluminum	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Bags	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Clamshells	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Cold Cups	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Eating Utensils	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Food Wrapping And Misc.	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Hot Cups	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Paper Napkins And Towels	Approved		On contract
Foodware	Paper Plates And Containers	Approved		On contract
Fuel	Biodiesel	Approved		On contract
Janitorial Cleaners	Bathroom, Tub, Tile	Approved		On contract
Janitorial Cleaners	Bowl Cleaners (Non-Acid)		Suggested	
Janitorial Cleaners	Bowl Cleaners- Acid		Suggested	
Janitorial Cleaners	Carpet Cleaners		Suggested	
Janitorial Cleaners	Cleaner - Degreasers	Approved		On contract
Janitorial Cleaners	Disinfecting Cleaners		Suggested	

Category	Sub-Category	Approved* (City Depts. are required to buy this product)	Suggested* (City Depts. are encouraged but not required to try this product)	Citywide Term Contract
Janitorial Cleaners	General Purpose Cleaners	Approved		On contract
Janitorial Cleaners	Glass Cleaners	Approved		On contract
Janitorial Papers	Paper Towels	Approved		On contract
Janitorial Papers	Toilet Seat Covers	Approved		On contract
Janitorial Papers	Toilet Tissue	Approved		On contract
Lighting	Ballasts	Approved		On contract
Lighting	Bulbs, Tubes	Approved		On contract
**Lighting	Fixtures	Approved		On contract
Office Papers	Copier & Bond	Approved		On contract
***Pest Management	Pesticides (Least-Toxic)	Approved		
***Toner Cartridges	Remanufactured		Suggested	
Wood	Not Treated With Arsenic	Approved		
TOTAL SUBCATEGORIES		27	5	25

[*In SF Approved Green Product Catalog as of 12/31/08. Does not include the high number of products added in early 2009.](#)

**Added in 2008

***Updated in 2008

III. Trends & Lessons Learned

- 1) In general, departments are increasing their purchases of green products substantially. However, incomplete sales data significantly hampers SFE's ability to track progress.
- 2) Vendor compliance with sales reporting requirements has been fair to poor. For example, the largest vendor of cleaning products, Santora Sales, only supplied data on SF Approved products sold, making calculation of percentage SF Approved products (the relevant performance measure) impossible to calculate. All other janitorial vendors provided complete data. In the previous report, purchases of green cleaning products increased from 1% to 59% of total purchases. For the lamps & ballasts, Omega Pacific had supplied complete sales data in 2007, but did not provide data for the 2008 report. The other vendor, Maltby Electric, provided no data in 2007 but was able to supply data for 2008. These inconsistencies make performance tracking very difficult.
- 3) Obtaining useable data from vendor sales reports requires a major investment in staff time. Reporting requirements need to be further simplified. A "data warehouse" arrangement may be explored as a way to improve compliance.
- 4) City staff expressed a need for information on green product performance, particular for chemical products such as cleaners and pesticides.
- 5) The greatest progress has been achieved in areas where SFE staff have worked closely with other departments to problem-solve, test new products, and remove obstacles.

- 6) Compliance with the SF Approved lists was higher with products that have lower brand loyalty, and for products where performance receives less attention, such as office papers. By contrast, janitorial cleaners and lamps were more difficult targets.

IV. Performance of City Departments

Because of incomplete data submissions, it was not possible to identify clear leaders among City departments for lamps or janitorial products, as we did in 2007. A percentage breakdown of SF Approved purchases is required for such an assessment.

It was possible to identify departments and individuals that are purchasing non-SF Approved products. These departments are being targeted for future outreach and training efforts.

V. Workplan for the Next Reporting Period

A. Computers

- 1) Collaborate with OCA, Dept. of Technology and IT Store vendors in developing a workable sales reporting system.
- 2) Work directly with IT Store vendors to develop and improve outreach and education on green computer products.
- 3) Monitor development of new Energy Star standards for computer servers.

B. Disposable Food Containers

SFE staff have been working closely with hospital staff to incorporate compostable foodware into their food systems. Composting is currently limited because non-compostable foodware is mixed with the waste stream. The ultimate objective is to allow composting of all food waste from the food services.

C. Food

- 1) SFE will work with OCA and SF DPH to include requirements of locally produced and/or organically certified products in the new citywide dairy contract.
- 2) SFE will continue to collaborate with the DPH and the Mayor's Office to finalize an executive order on sustainably produced, healthy foods.

D. Janitorial Cleaners

- 1) An alternatives analysis of disinfectants will be completed. New disinfectant products will be added to the SF Approved catalog.
- 2) Feedback on hard floor care systems will be summarized, and appropriate changes made to SF Approved catalog.
- 3) Outreach will be conducted on the above topics with end user groups.
- 4) Departments lagging behind on purchase of SF Approved cleaners will be specifically targeted for site visits and outreach.

E. Lamps

- 1) SFE will hold meetings with end-users and SF PUC to increase purchases of EPP lamps and other lighting equipment.
- 2) SFE will work with OCA to publish and evaluate the new lamps & ballasts contract
- 3) SFE will meet lamps vendors to ascertain better ways to ensure sales data submission

F. Paints

- 1) SFE will work with City painters to design pilot tests of SF Approved paint products

G. Carpet

- 1) SFE will review existing carpet standards/certifications and identify the best available, for inclusion in the SF Approved Lists.

Table 2. Summary of SF Approved Green Product Sales to San Francisco City Departments, 2008.

PRODUCT CATEGORY	PRODUCT SUB-CATEGORY	07 % SF Approved purchases (out of total purchases in category)	07 Total \$ of SF Approved green purchases (out of total purchases in category)	08 Total ALL purchases in category (\$)	08 % SF Approved purchases (out of total purchases in category)	08 Total SF Approved purchases (\$)	% difference in SF APPROVED products purchased between 2007 & 2008	Notes
Computers	Desktops	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Vendors on previous contract unwilling/unable to provide sales data. One vendor provided 06 data showing approx. 70% of computer purchases were EPEAT-Silver compliant. New IT Store vendors are required to report sales data in contract - work is underway to establish reporting system. EPEAT-Gold and Climate Savers purchasing criteria adopted early 2009.
	Laptops	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	
	Monitors	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	
	Servers - non-blade	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	
	TOTAL	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	
Foodware	Compostable	Data incomplete	\$ 193,528.74	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 219,265.08	Data incomplete	Data on non-recyclable/non-compostable purchases not available
	Recyclable	Data incomplete	\$ 18,456.20	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 42,048.22	Data incomplete	
	TOTAL		\$ 211,884.94	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 261,313.30	23%	
Janitorial Cleaners	Bathroom, Tub, Tile	0%	\$0.00	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 41,504.59	No sales in 2007	
	Degreasers	74%	\$10,406.00	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 26,967.00	159%	General degreasers, not specialized
	General Purpose Cleaners	29%	\$1,718.50	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 10,505.52	511%	
	Glass cleaners	0%	\$0.00	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 547.76	Data incomplete	Conflicting data on 07 sales: ADPICs showed SF Approved sales, vendor records showed no sales.
	TOTAL		\$12,124.50	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	\$ 79,524.87	556%	Major City vendor did not supply data on non-SF Approved sales
Janitorial Papers	Paper Towels	100%	\$464,223.61	N/A	N/A	\$ 623,761.76	34%	
	Toilet Seat Covers	100%	\$85,766.97	N/A	N/A	\$ 51,744.15	-40%	
	Toilet Tissue	58%	\$115,982.19	N/A	N/A	\$ 251,234.00	117%	
	TOTAL		\$665,972.77	N/A	N/A	\$ 926,739.91	39%	
Lighting (bulbs/ lamps, ballasts)	CFLS	63%	\$3,657.60	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Vendor that did not submit 08 report is responsible for most CFL sales.
	Lamps	31%	\$152,753.80	\$14,805 (1 vendor only)	78% (1 vendor only)	\$ 11,503.29	Data incomplete	
	Ballasts	85%	\$40,678.20	\$3,852 (1 vendor only)	84% (1 vendor only)	\$ 3,249.45	Data incomplete	

PRODUCT CATEGORY	PRODUCT SUB-CATEGORY	07 % SF Approved purchases (out of total purchases in category)	07 Total \$ of SF Approved green purchases (out of total purchases in category)	08 Total ALL purchases in category (\$)	08 % SF Approved purchases (out of total purchases in category)	08 Total SF Approved purchases (\$)	% difference in SF APPROVED products purchased between 2007 & 2008	Notes
Multifunction Printers	Ricoh		307 units	N/A - leases	N/A - leases	382 units	24%	Combination printers/scanners/fax machines. Leased, not purchased.
	Xerox		357 units	N/A - leases	N/A - leases	374 units	5%	
	Konica Minolta		278 units	N/A - leases	N/A - leases	313 units	13%	
	TOTAL		942 units	N/A - leases	N/A - leases	1069 units	13%	
Office Paper (Copier & Bond)	30% PCW			\$ 145,533.10	88%	\$ 145,533.10	N/A	08 data was from City ADPICS system only; 07 data was directly from vendor sales reports. Major discrepancy suggests misreporting in ADPICS data, so conclusions on trends could not be drawn. Mayor's Executive Directive 08-02 issued 3/4/08 requires 100% post-consumer waste (PCW) paper; term contract that includes 100% PCW awarded 11/08. Prior to that, 30% PCW was considered SF Approved. Does not include colored & specialty papers.
	50% PCW			\$ 775.09	0%	\$ 775.09	N/A	
	100% PCW			\$ 18,703.48	11%	\$ 18,703.48	N/A	
	TOTAL	93%	\$524,766.00	\$ 165,011.67	100%	\$ 165,011.67	N/A	
Office Supplies	Batteries (rechargeables size AAA to D, 1.5-9-volt)	42%	\$8,596.57	\$ 33,504.80	49%	\$ 16,409.55	17%	Office supplies contract includes blocks on purchases for many non-recycled content items, for which preferable alternatives exist. Sales report formats did not permit easy reporting on these items. Remanufactured toner cartridges were no longer listed as SF Approved in 2008 pending the development of better performance specifications.
	Recycled content file folders, notebooks, many other items	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	Data incomplete	
TOTAL PRODUCTS (excludes copiers (MFDs))			\$950,804.01			\$ 1,463,752.04	54%	